

**Leonard Bernstein's *Young People's Concerts:*
*A Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich in Context***

On December 18, 1965 Leonard Bernstein began writing his script for the New York Philharmonic Young People's Concert number nineteen, *A Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich*. Using pencil and working alone, as Bernstein always did when preparing materials for the televised concert series, the polymath musician found himself musing on the great composer's nationality.¹ "When we say the name Shostakovich," Bernstein wrote:

What is the one thing we immediately think of? Russia, of course. And what is the first and main quality of this Russian man? His Russian-ness. Shostakovich's devotion has not only been to his art, but also to his country...He is a very patriotic man, but he is also an artist, and that combination has sometimes gotten him into hot water with the people who guide the very revolution in which he grew up.²

Three weeks later, on January 6, 1966, when Bernstein gave his opening remarks for the concert, a different picture of Shostakovich emerged. Terms like patriot and revolution do not appear in the recorded concert. Instead Bernstein describes a shy genius, vulnerable to critics, with a broad compositional range.³ Bernstein threw out his first attempt; in a later draft for the concert Bernstein scribbled in a margin: "Birthdays should be gay. Hence avoid the serious, heavy, patriotic aspects and emphasize the merry."⁴

Shostakovich composed his Ninth Symphony, which forms the musical part of Bernstein's birthday tribute to the composer, in August 1945. Upon its premiere in Leningrad in November 1945 the composer remarked "musicians will love to play it and

John Crooks

critics will delight in blasting it.”⁵ Although Shostakovich was enjoying a period of success in the Soviet Union when his Ninth Symphony was first performed, within three years he received his critical blast when, in February 1948, the Central Committee of the All-Union Communist Party gave its Decree on Music. According to the decree Shostakovich’s music was “alien to the Soviet people and their artistic tastes,” and it recommended that the government “take the necessary steps for improving the state of affairs in Soviet music, and liquidate the faults enumerated in the present decree.”⁶ In response the composer turned contrite and reflective. “There have been many serious faults and failures in my work...I have always heeded criticism directed against me, and tried in every way to work better and harder.”⁷ As a result of the decree, Shostakovich lost his teaching positions in Moscow and Leningrad.⁸

Clearly Bernstein was correct in his preparatory writings. Shostakovich was challenged, cowed, and even persecuted by his nation’s political system. In the end, however, Bernstein decided not to include any discussion of Shostakovich’s situation as a composer in Soviet Russia in his birthday tribute. Shostakovich was right as well in his observations about the Ninth Symphony. It is a wonderful piece to play and a staple of the orchestral repertoire to this day, yet somehow the composer knew that harsh judgments would be made of this work. One of the leading symphonic composers of the century, Shostakovich, even while composing masterful works like the Ninth Symphony, was criticized broadly by his fellow composers. “Primitive psychology found expression in the Ninth Symphony,” a Soviet composer and musicologist said on the occasion of the 1948 decree, which “hampers the progress of his [Shostakovich’s] talent, from which our people expect so much.”⁹

John Crooks

The programs for the *Young People's Concerts* were usually selected from works recently performed by the orchestra. In October 1965 Shostakovich's Ninth Symphony was performed in New York by both the New York Philharmonic and, on its first visit to the US, the Moscow Philharmonic.¹⁰ The work's short length, popularity, and the event of Shostakovich's 60th birthday made it a natural choice for Bernstein as he planned his January 1966 Young People's Concert. But what would the great conductor say about Shostakovich and his Ninth Symphony? What is the best musical lesson? Why did Bernstein turn away from his initial ideas? These questions must be answered within a larger discussion which addresses Bernstein as a cultural figure and pedagogue, Shostakovich and his role in the culture of Soviet society and the Cold War, the framework of the *Young People's Concerts*, and both men's function within the fragile US/USSR system of cultural exchange.

What Does Music Mean?

Leonard Bernstein had been music director of the New York Philharmonic for only two weeks when the first televised *Young People's Concert* was broadcast on CBS in January 1958.¹¹ Titled *What Does Music Mean?* this program set the tone for a series of concerts which continued for fourteen years and were Bernstein's tour de force as a teacher and charismatic messenger of classical music. Children's concerts featuring the conductor's remarks had been a part of the Philharmonic's schedule since 1924¹², but Bernstein, with the new medium of television, used the form innovatively and powerfully.

In the first broadcast, Bernstein sets forth his pedagogical ground rules, tenets he adheres to throughout the series:

When we ask "what does it mean - what does this piece of music mean?", then we're asking a hard question...It's a funny thing about this meaning business - in music, anyway...The meaning of music is in the music, in its melodies, and in the rhythms, and the harmonies...all you have to know is that music has its own meanings, right there for you to find inside the music itself...If you like music at all, you'll find out the meanings for yourselves, just by listening to it.¹³

This framework creates a privileged space within which the study and effects of musical sound are abstracted from the larger issues of society. An excellent vehicle for broad instruction, Bernstein used this as the basis of his approach in concerts teaching musical form, non European music in the concert hall, great composers of the 20th Century, and many more topics vital to the understanding and preservation of symphonic music. Thus it is surprising to find Bernstein introducing extramusical issues of criticism, politicized nationality, and revolution in his first notes for *A Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich*.

“Every so often, he [Shostakovich] has been accused of writing so called decadent music – Western, Bourgeois music, too experimental...” and here Bernstein’s first draft trails off.¹⁴ The broadcast of *A Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich* confirms that Bernstein abandoned this direction and found another basis for his opening remarks, an approach which would fit within his own format, and avoid the overtly political direction of his rough draft.

Of course, Bernstein was not alone in creating the format of *The Young People’s Concerts*; his image and effectiveness as a performer and educator on television were only partially informed by the concept of studying music in its purest form. In addition to the orchestra and guest artists, the broadcasts needed camera crews, additional stage managers, various technical and support staff, and all kinds of resources not normally

John Crooks

required for an orchestra concert. Perhaps most importantly, Bernstein worked very closely with his directors, producers, and the broadcast network CBS.

The first three *Young People's Concerts* were produced by Roger Englander and directed by Charles S. Dubin, both experienced television directors. Starting with the fourth concert Englander became the producer and director of the program, and retained both of those titles through the 1960s. What became of Dubin? "Something very peculiar happened," recalled Englander in a 1990 interview, "We encountered the blacklist at CBS. Charles Dubin, because of something in his background, was put on the blacklist...he couldn't do any more shows."¹⁵ Coverage of the case in the *New York Times* confirms this story; Dubin was indeed fired from CBS (and NBC, where he worked as the director of *Twenty One*) because he refused to testify before the House Committee on Un-American Activities.¹⁶ Dubin, who directed that first highly influential *Young People's Concert*, was targeted by an American committee eerily reminiscent of the Central Committee of the All-Union Communist Party which attacked Shostakovich in 1948. He did not work in the television industry again until 1963.¹⁷

This incident opens a new avenue of exploration which informs the framework set forth by Bernstein in *What Does Music Mean?* The privileged space and national reach of these televised concerts exists within a larger context of corporate and political propaganda. In this context the pure values of the *Young People's Concerts* were useful for CBS. In May 1961 FCC chair Newton Minow made a speech directed at the broadcast networks' heads of programming in which he described television as a "vast wasteland," and went on to say "Search your consciences and see if you cannot offer more to your young beneficiaries whose future you guide so many hours each and every day."¹⁸ In his

John Crooks

1990 interview Roger Englander remembers “yes...Newton Minow uttered his famous ‘vast wasteland’ speech. To counter this claim against the culturally unrewarding aspect of television, CBS put the *Young People’s Concerts* at 7:30 during prime time.”¹⁹ CBS, which aired the *Young People’s Concerts* without commercial interruption, was interested in patronizing Bernstein’s quixotic musical mission partly for its marquee value in a struggle for legitimacy.

The framework of the *Young People’s Concerts*, as set forth in the first broadcast concert, reflect Bernstein’s strong feeling that music should be encountered first on its own terms as sound. In 1963 Bernstein criticized the world of contemporary music appreciation, which was often preoccupied with the larger social context of a particular music, as “specious and commercial... it turns every note or phrase or chord into a cloud or crag or Cossack.”²⁰ Although these extramusical ‘Cossacks’ rarely entered the privileged space of *Young People’s Concerts* broadcasts, they hovered all around it, capable of spiriting away its creators, like Charles Dubin, and eager to use the concerts for their own advancement.

“Russianness”

The 1948 decree against Shostakovich was not the first official criticism he endured. Launched to international fame at the age of twenty by the success of his first symphony, Shostakovich negotiated the dangerous waters of Communist Party patronage his entire life. His first major brush with official censure came in 1936. After being seen by Stalin and his cronies his popular opera *Lady Macbeth* was anonymously criticized in

John Crooks

Pravda, a Party organ, and, amid an avalanche of official vitriol, “Shostakovich kept a small suitcase packed and ready.”²¹ His only confidante at the time, a general named Mikhail Tukhachevsky, was arrested and killed in 1937.²²

Shostakovich was a cipher. By turns party mouthpiece, cause celebre, and whipping boy, the composer’s writings and pronouncements, always filtered through official channels, cannot be tested for veracity.²³ Perhaps most striking are contemporary descriptions of the composer’s physical demeanor and lack of self regard in public. “A man crushed and beaten...who sees no future for himself;”²⁴ “He chews not merely his nails but his fingers, twitches his pouty mouth and chin, chain smokes, wiggles his nose in constant adjustment of his spectacles, looks querulous one moment and ready to cry the next...there is no betrayal of the thoughts behind those frightened, very intelligent eyes.”²⁵ He is described by Bernstein in the *Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich* as “a very reserved man, speaking very little, a bit nervous, and very shy... hidden behind his eyeglasses.”²⁶

Nonetheless there is little doubt that Dmitri Shostakovich maintained a strong loyalty to his country. Less than a year after the composer’s 1948 censure Stalin contacted the composer and requested that he travel to New York for the Cultural and Scientific Conference for World Peace. Shostakovich agreed only after Stalin had the damning 1948 decree reversed.²⁷ Within ten days Shostakovich was in New York, part of the Soviet Union’s official envoy to the conference. Outside his hotel demonstrators held signs exhorting the composer to jump out the window to freedom.²⁸ The composer demurred and stuck steadfastly to the script prepared for him by the Communist Party. Something deep kept Shostakovich in Russia.

Leonard Bernstein shared some of this “Russianness.” His family roots in Poland and the Ukraine were within the boundaries of Soviet Russia, and many of his early teachers were Russian. Serge Koussevitzky, one of Bernstein’s many mentors, was a patron of Russian music who had earned his stripes as a conductor in Moscow and St. Petersburg. By 1945, at the young age of 27, Bernstein was involved in charity events for children in Stalingrad and was an active proponent of new Russian music.²⁹ Bernstein’s first visit to the Soviet Union in 1959, on a tour with the New York Philharmonic, was a triumphant affair for the conductor and galvanized his dedication to the Russian cause. About the Russian people Bernstein said “they want to touch me, shake my hand, embrace me, even kiss me...Nothing will be worth a hill of beans if we don’t have peace.”³⁰

These two great musicians shared a passion for Russian music while presenting opposite personal and professional attributes. Shostakovich affected a weak and quavering aspect as he muddled through his life as a great composer in Soviet Russia; Bernstein, a Russophile American, used his supernatural charisma to forward Russian music. While Shostakovich endured life altering yet whimsical criticism from on high even for his instrumental works, Bernstein’s world showered almost hysterical praise on his politically charged musicals *West Side Story* and *Candide*.

Bernstein must have been aware of these differences. Given an opportunity to perform and teach Shostakovich’s 9th Symphony in the national eye he was faced with a variety of challenging curatorial choices; the elegant dictum set forth in *What Does Music Mean?* severely limited his rhetorical palette. Without directly confronting

John Crooks

Shostakovich's uncomfortable position within the Soviet regime how could he properly teach young people in the US about the composer and his work?

Symphony No. 9 in E Flat Major, Opus 70

Shostakovich's point of view, hidden in his written and spoken words, is expressed well in his compositions. His Ninth Symphony, with its minimal instrumentation and usage of classical forms, is no exception. The composer's two previous symphonies had been epic in scope, and many listeners in 1945 were surprised that the Ninth Symphony was not doubly so, given the Soviet Union's recent triumph over the Nazis and the generally held belief that a Ninth Symphony must be ambitious.³¹

The symphony, in five movements, is concise in the extreme and often cleaves to the most time honored symphonic traditions.³² The principal themes of the first movement daringly move from one key to another while withstanding a number of absurd and surprising contextual shifts. The movement is punctuated by an unruly trombone. At times locked in martial rhythm with the snare drum, this trombone also occasionally wanders off, loudly repeating its assertive two note riff. The second movement, slow, mysterious, and in a contrasting key, is scored very sparsely. Woodwinds, strings, and occasional French horn weave through this haunting movement filled with arcane, syrupy melodies.

The final three movements are played without pause. The third Scherzo movement is launched by an athletic solo clarinet, which is soon joined by increasingly assertive strings. A plangent trumpet melody accompanied by an insistent tattoo sounds

John Crooks

inexorably alien. The strings, at first rhythmically square, become increasingly syncopated, until their pulse is in a new and unexpected place. They take over and turn suddenly broad and wistful, bringing us to the wonderfully short fourth movement in which a ponderous brass chorus begs for an epic statement; a single mournful bassoon recites a long winded, introspective response. Suddenly the finale is reached, and the intrepid bassoon introduces the final theme. Developed relentlessly through the final movement this theme is joined by a counter melody. After dissolving in a chromatic cloud these themes return accompanied by a decidedly festive tambourine. A faster tempo sets in and the now familiar themes are by turns expanded and shortened until the unexpected final cadence is reached.

Critical response to the Ninth Symphony was mixed. Many dismissed the piece as small and unambitious; Bernstein himself, at the US premier of the work in 1946, is reported to have called the piece “a bore.”³³ Indeed, the subtler messages in Shostakovich’s Ninth Symphony are easy to miss. Anachronistic classical forms, silly instrumental interludes, and overly maudlin melodies can distract even the careful listener from a deeper revelation: At the end of the war, Shostakovich is surveying death and destruction, and pointing out its absurdity. The constant return of disorganized martial rhythms and themes underline the essential, tragic futility of war, and its dehumanizing dark frivolity. The sentimental second movement weakly reaches for some other parallel world unmarred by war and strife and repeatedly fails.

In Russia the Ninth Symphony had some proponents, notably Lev Mazel, who interestingly compared the piece to Charlie Chaplin and *Bambi*.³⁴ Ivan Martynov, a friend and early biographer of the composer, encapsulates part of the genius of the Ninth

John Crooks

Symphony. “To be novel and original with such strictly limited means of expression is the gift of the chosen few.”³⁵ This assessment, made in regard to the chamber music type orchestration, is fruitful also as regards Shostakovich’s sense of his own role in Soviet music and culture. The Ninth Symphony can be seen, with its self consciously classical forms and short length, as a reflection of the “limited means of expression” extended to Shostakovich as a composer in the Soviet Union.

Soviet critics who supported the work were censured along with the composer, either in the 1948 decree, or at a meeting of musicologists held in Moscow in February 1949.³⁶ The work and its proponents were criticized partly because of the success of the Ninth Symphony overseas. At the 1948 conference a composer named Vladimir Zakharov said “Shostakovich’s Seventh, Eighth, and Ninth are supposed to be considered as works of genius abroad. But who considers them as such? Who...apart from the reactionaries against whom we fight, apart from the bandits and imperialists?”³⁷ This point of view introduces a new aspect to the study of Shostakovich’s Ninth Symphony and the meanings hidden within its reception.

As a Soviet composer whose works were popular outside the Soviet Union, Shostakovich was an easy target for Party hardliners and ambitious but untalented composers.³⁸ However, his genius was also an indispensable tool in the field of cultural exchange between the Soviet Union and the US, and his great skill as a composer, paired with his ambiguous personal convictions, was exploited by each side. Shostakovich was frequently sent overseas, as he was at Stalin’s request in 1949, to represent Soviet excellence in the arts. Meanwhile the western press would cover events such as the 1948 decree to underline the repressive nature of the Soviet Regime.³⁹ Wittingly or not,

John Crooks

Bernstein and his *Young People's Concerts* were a part of this process. "The competitive element in East-West cultural intercourse during the cold war was often thinly masked as 'exchange' or 'diplomacy'...the handshake and the arm-wrestle merged."⁴⁰ In the fall of 1965, just as the *Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich* was being prepared, relations between the US and the Soviet Union were quite poor as a result of the Vietnam War. Several American exhibitions and theater events scheduled to travel to Moscow were canceled by the Soviets.⁴¹ But Bernstein's concert went ahead. Who won this arm wrestle? The Soviet party poopers who canceled *Hello Dolly* or the US via CBS, which aired a politically neutral, commercial free concert examining the music of a great Soviet composer?

A Birthday Tribute

Bernstein dispatched his duties as educator and interpreter with great clarity and cleverness in the *Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich*. His direction, given the background, was innovative, unexpected, and remarkably astute. Opening with an excerpt from Shostakovich's Seventh Symphony, interesting because its melody is in equal parts Russian and American in character, Bernstein goes on to toast Shostakovich in his birthday year. After a description of the man and his great range as a composer, Bernstein says:

You should know that Shostakovich is also world-famous for his marvelous sense of humor. He has written some of the most downright funny music there is to be heard, and therefore I think it's especially proper for us to celebrate his birthday in an atmosphere of fun. So in just a moment, instead of a long serious work, we're going to play you one of his gayest and most amusing works--his Ninth Symphony... This whole symphony by Shostakovich is all humorous, every minute and every movement. It is all one big series of jokes.⁴²

John Crooks

And here is the perfect starting point for an investigation of Shostakovich and his Ninth Symphony. Well within the boundaries of the thesis set forth in *What Does Music Mean?*, a discussion of Shostakovich's use of humor and the absurd in the Ninth Symphony reveals the compositional mechanisms of the work and leaves the young listener prepared for further study of the piece and its composer.

Indeed Shostakovich is known as a master of the musical joke, and for many critics the Ninth Symphony was a great spoof. "In this symphony Shostakovich turned his orchestra into a troupe of clowns,"⁴³ wrote one musicologist. "A symphony full of cheer,"⁴⁴ wrote another. Of course, Bernstein knew a great deal about Shostakovich and, as his first draft reveals, he knew that for the composer there were a great deal of extramusical 'Cossacks' to be overcome every day, which must have informed the background of the music and musical jokes in the Ninth Symphony. But within the privileged space of this concert, and despite the fact that it, and Shostakovich himself, were proxies freely exploited within the cold war, Bernstein admirably teaches the Ninth Symphony.

Bernstein's broadcast solution to the problem of teaching and performing Shostakovich's Ninth Symphony, although graceful, reveals the conductor's own struggle to make his feelings known. Bernstein was aware of the untenable situation faced by composers in Soviet Russia and wanted to discuss this problem. Despite the bully pulpit provided by CBS Bernstein was hamstrung: His own framework for the *Young People's Concerts* denied him the freedom necessary to address Shostakovich's work and life head on. The social issues which Bernstein felt were overstated in music appreciation circles

were, ironically, central to his appreciation of Shostakovich's Ninth Symphony. As a result, he was reduced to jokes. Informative musical jokes, perhaps, but jokes nonetheless. In order to remain both a composer and a Russian Shostakovich had to conceal and ignore his own feelings, or worse, compromise himself; when it came to teaching Shostakovich on American television Bernstein was also forced to dissemble.

Bernstein's initial pedagogical instinct as recorded in his draft for the concert was delayed but not ignored. *The Young People's Concerts*, as discussed, were formed with a very specific mission; to teach young television viewers (and, as it turned out, people of all ages) about music in the concert hall without referencing the larger world. In 1970, four years after the *Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich*, Bernstein gave an introductory address to students at Tanglewood. Many of them had probably seen the *Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich*. In this environment Bernstein had none of the strictures imposed by the *Young People's Concerts*. His remarks on this occasion, declamatory and urgent, reference the educational neutrality Bernstein defended in the *Young People's Concerts* and exhort his now less young listeners to work towards a world where figures like Shostakovich will not be so harshly manipulated:

We taught you to believe, and to expect, that the world could work; that all mouths could be fed...we taught you to hope as no one has ever hoped before in history...So okay, you say, thanks a lot, we've learned a lot about progress and democracy and international brotherhood and racial equality and the elimination of the class struggle—so where is it?...What do you mean, Peace, when the whole world is being juggled and inflamed by two superpowers?...Enough with black-white-red-pinko-Commie-fascist-faggot-hippy hatreds...we have to work faster and harder if we're going to take our next social step.⁴⁵

Here, perhaps, is the final draft of the discarded initial script for the *Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich*.

Notes

- ¹ Meryle Secrest, *Leonard Bernstein: A Life* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1994), 245.
- ² Leonard Bernstein et al. Notes for Leonard Bernstein's *Young People's Concerts: A Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich*, box 172, Leonard Bernstein Collection, Music Division, Library of Congress, Washington, D.C.
- ³ Leonard Bernstein, Roger Englander, and Charles Dubin, "Leonard Bernstein's Young People's Concerts with the New York Philharmonic: A Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich." Kultur Video D1503, 2004.
- ⁴ Bernstein, Notes for Leonard Bernstein's *Young People's Concerts*.
- ⁵ No original source could be found for this quotation; however, the composer is quoted as making this statement in Roy Blokker and Robert Dearling, *The Music of Dmitri Shostakovich, the Symphonies* (London: Tantivy Press, 1979), 106, as well as in "Shostakovich in the Berkshires," *Time*, August 6, 1946; www.time.com (Accessed October 22, 2007).
- ⁶ Alexander Werth, *Musical Uproar in Moscow* (1949; Repr., Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1973), 33.
- ⁷ Dmitrii Shostakovich, Lev Grigoryev, and Ya Platek, *Dmitry Shostakovich: About Himself and His Times* (Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1980), 126.
- ⁸ David Caute. *The Dancer Defects: The Struggle for Cultural Supremacy During the Cold War* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2003), 420.
- ⁹ V.A. Belyi, quoted in Werth, *Musical Uproar in Moscow*, 72.
- ¹⁰ Richard D. Freed, "Bernstein Leads Shostakovich 9th," *New York Times*, October 15, 1965, 49; Harold C. Schonberg, "Philharmonic in Debut at Carnegie Hall," *New York Times*, October 16, 1965, 11.
- ¹¹ "About Bernstein: Young People's Concerts," www.leonardbernstein.com (Accessed November 12, 2007).
- ¹² Ronald Eyer "Are Those Concerts Still Concerts?" *New York Times*, January 22, 1967, 17.
- ¹³ Leonard Bernstein, "Leonard Bernstein's Young People's Concerts with the New York Philharmonic: What Does Music Mean?"
- ¹⁴ Bernstein, Notes for Leonard Bernstein's *Young People's Concerts*.
- ¹⁵ Merrill Brockway and Brian Geoffrey Rose, *Televising the Performing Arts: Interviews with Merrill Brockway, Kirk Browning, and Roger Englander*, Contributions to the study of Music and Dance, 29 (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1992), 132.
- ¹⁶ Richard F. Shepard, "N.B.C. TV Producer Returns to C.B.S.," *New York Times*, July 10, 1958, 55.
- ¹⁷ "Charles S. Dubin," *The Internet Movie Database*; www.imdb.com/name/nm0239291/ (Accessed November 20, 2007).

¹⁸ Newton Minow “Television and the Public Interest,” speech given May 9, 1961, in Washington D.C. Sound file and transcription available at www.americanrhetoric.com (Accessed November 20, 2007).

¹⁹ Brockway and Rose, *Televising the Performing Arts*, 135.

²⁰ Leonard Bernstein, “Introduction,” in *The Joy of Music*, 1963, complete text at www.leonardbernstein.com (Accessed November 23, 2007).

²¹ Caute, *The Dancer Defects*, 416.

²² Biographical facts regarding Dmitri Shostakovich are taken from David Fanning and Laurel Fay, “Shostakovich, Dmitry,” *Grove Music Online*, ed. Laura Macy (Accessed October 31, 2007).

²³ Caute, *The Dancer Defects*, 421.

²⁴ Werth, *Musical Uproar in Moscow*, 40.

²⁵ Igor Stravinsky and Robert Craft, *Dialogues and a Diary* (Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1963), 292.

²⁶ Leonard Bernstein, “Leonard Bernstein's Young People's Concerts with the New York Philharmonic: A Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich.”

²⁷ Caute, *The Dancer Defects*, 421.

²⁸ Alex Ross, “Appalachian Autumn,” *The New Yorker*, August 27, 2007, 36.

²⁹ Biographical facts regarding Bernstein are taken from: Meryle Secrest, *Leonard Bernstein: A Life* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1994).

³⁰ Leonard Bernstein, *Newsweek*, September 7, 1959; quoted in Secrest, 268.

³¹ Boris Schwarz, *Music and Musical Life in Soviet Russia* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1983), 211.

³² The following full sized Soviet era score was used for research on the Ninth Symphony: Dmitrii Shostakovich, *Sobranie sochinenii v soroka dvukh tomakh* (Moscow: Muzyka, 1979).

³³ “Shostakovich in the Berkshires,” *Time*, August 6, 1946, www.time.com (Accessed October 22, 2007).

³⁴ Schwarz, *Music and Musical Life in Soviet Russia*, 251.

³⁵ Ivan Martynov, *Dmitri Shostakovich: The Man and His Work*, Translated by T. Guaralsky (New York, Philosophical Library, 1947), 149.

³⁶ Schwarz, *Music and Musical Life in Soviet Russia*, 249.

³⁷ Werth, *Musical Uproar in Moscow*, 54.

³⁸ Werth, *Musical Uproar in Moscow*, 30.

³⁹ Caute, *The Dancer Defects*, 380.

⁴⁰ Caute, *The Dancer Defects*, 6.

⁴¹ Caute, *The Dancer Defects*, 31.

⁴² Leonard Bernstein “Leonard Bernstein's Young People's Concerts with the New York Philharmonic: A Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich.”

⁴³ Roy Blokker and Robert Dearling, *The Music of Dmitri Shostakovich, the Symphonies* (London: Tantivy Press, 1979), 110.

⁴⁴ Martynov, *Dmitri Shostakovich: The Man and His Work*, 153.

⁴⁵ Leonard Bernstein, *Findings* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1982), 282-283.

Bibliography

Abraham, Gerald. *Eight Soviet Composers*. London and New York: Oxford University Press, 1943.

Agnew, Jean-Christophe, and Roy Rosenzweig. *A Companion to Post-1945 America*. Blackwell Companions to American History. Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2002.

"Bernstein Gains Full House and High Praise in London." *New York Times*, December 10, 1966, 44.

Bernstein, Leonard. *Findings*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1982.

Bernstein, Leonard. *The Infinite Variety of Music*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1966.

Bernstein, Leonard, et al. *Leonard Bernstein at Harvard "The Unanswered Question," Norton Lectures 1973*. West Long Branch, NJ: Kultur Video D1570, 2001.

Bernstein, Leonard, Roger Englander, and Charles Dubin. *Leonard Bernstein's Young People's Concerts with the New York Philharmonic*. Kultur Video D1503, 2004.

Bernstein, Leonard, and Jack Gottlieb. *Leonard Bernstein's Young People's Concerts*. New York: Anchor Books, 1992.

Bernstein, Leonard, et al. Notes for Leonard Bernstein's *Young People's Concerts: A Birthday Tribute to Shostakovich*. Box 172; Leonard Bernstein Collection, Music Division, Library of Congress, Washington, D.C.

Blokker, Roy, and Robert Dearling. *The Music of Dmitri Shostakovich: The Symphonies*. London: Tantivy Press, 1979.

Brockway, Merrill, and Brian Geoffrey Rose. *Televising the Performing Arts: Interviews with Merrill Brockway, Kirk Browning, and Roger Englander*. Contributions to the study of Music and Dance, 29. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1992.

Carpenter, C. R. "Potential Uses of Television and Films in Music Education." *Music Educator's Journal* 52, no. 3 (Jan, 1966): 52-54.

Caute, David. *The Dancer Defects: The Struggle for Cultural Supremacy During the Cold War*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003.

Fanning, David, and Fay, Laurel E. "Shostakovich, Dmitry," *Grove Music Online*, ed. Laura Macy (Accessed October 31, 2007).

Freed, Richard D, "Bernstein Leads Shostakovich 9th." *New York Times*, October 15, 1965, 45.

Gradenwitz, Peter. *Leonard Bernstein: The Infinite Variety of a Musician*. Leamington Spa: Berg, 1987.

Gustafson, Robert. "Conductor Explains Music from Podium." *The Christian Science Monitor*, Dec 16, 1958, 5.

Hulme, Derek C. *Dmitri Shostakovich: A Catalogue, Bibliography, and Discography*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991.

Kay, Norman. *Shostakovich*. Oxford Studies of Composers, 8. London: Oxford University Press, 1971.

Klein, Howard, "Recordings: Shostakovich Symphony Stirs Controversy." *New York Times*, July 12, 1970, 91.

Laird, Paul R. *Leonard Bernstein: A Guide to Research*. Routledge Music Bibliographies. New York: Routledge, 2002.

Martynov, Ivan *Dmitri Shostakovich: The Man and His Work*. Translated by T. Guaralsky. New York: Philosophical Library, 1947.

Nabakoff, Nicolas, "Music Reviews." *Notes, Quarterly Journal of the Music Library Association* 2nd Series, 4, no. 3 (June 1947): 360-362.

Norris, Christopher. *Shostakovich: The Man and His Music*. London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1982.

Olkhovsky, Andrey Vasilyevich. *Music Under the Soviets: The Agony of an Art*. New York: Published for the Research Program on the U.S.S.R. by F.A. Praeger, 1955.

Osgood, Kenneth Alan. *Total Cold War Eisenhower's Secret Propaganda Battle at Home and Abroad*. Lawrence, KS: University of Kansas Press, 2006.

Ottaway, Hugh. *Shostakovich Symphonies*. London: BBC Press, 1978.

Perris, Arnold. *Music As Propaganda: Art to Persuade, Art to Control*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1985.

Ross, Alex, "Appalachian Autumn." *The New Yorker*, August 27, 2007, 34-40.

Rozen, Brian D. "Leonard Bernstein's Educational Legacy." *Music Educator's Journal* 78, no. 1 (September 1991): 43-46.

Shabad, Theodore. "Moscow Relaxing Ideology in Arts in Drive to Win Support Against Peking." *New York Times*, May 24, 1964: 6.

Schwarz, Boris. *Music and Musical Life in Soviet Russia*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1983.

Schiff, David. "Bernstein, Leonard," *Grove Music Online*, ed. Laura Macy.

Secrest, Meryle. *Leonard Bernstein: A Life*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1994.

"Shostakovich Attacks Writing of Stravinsky." *New York Times*, June 1, 1964: 32.

Shostakovich, Dmitriï Dmitrievich, Lev Grigoryev, and Ya Platek. *Dmitry Shostakovich: About Himself and His Times*. Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1980.

Shostakovich, Dmitriï Dmitrievich. *Sobranie sochineniï v soroka dvukh tomakh*. Moscow: Muzyka, 1979.

"Soviet Honors Shostakovich at 60." *The New York Times*, September 25, 1966: 2.

Stravinsky, Igor, and Robert Craft. *Dialogues and a Diary*. Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1963.

Walter, Bruno, and Robert Chesterman. *Conversations with Conductors Bruno Walter, Sir Adrian Boult, Leonard Bernstein, Ernest Ansermet, Otto Klemperer, Leopold Stokowski*. Totowa, N.J.: Rowman and Littlefield, 1976.

Werth, Alexander. *Musical Uproar in Moscow*. 1949. Reprint, Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1973.

Wolfe, Tom. *Radical Chic & Mau-Mauing the Flak Catchers*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1970.